Twilight Zoning: Slow Fade to Housing Diversity...

Garden City Case Study

Jenah Thornborrow- Garden City

APA Idaho Planning Conference
October 3, 2019
Garden City

- 4.04 land square miles
- 12,000 population
- 2,000 businesses
- Average density 2,716 (Average density in Idaho 19.5)
- Physically constrained by river, bench and 3 highways
- Average of 160,000 cars/ day
- Limited sidewalks, bike paths, transit, especially in eastern portion of city
- Diverse socioeconomic spectrum
- Part of Ada/ Canyon County Growth
  - 1998 TVP assumed build out 745,691
  - Almost doubled from 563,786 to 936,730 in 13 years
How does “Home” affect an individual?

Robert Wood Johnson Foundation Program County Health Rankings & Roadmaps indicates that Social and Economic factors in conjunction with Physical Environment = 50% determinant of health and life expectancy (Other 50% is health behaviors and clinical care)

- Where reside
- Where work
- Where recreate
- Access to goods and services
- Community (social support)
- Environmental factors (water, air, safety)

- “Broken Window” theory = crime
- Safety - e.g. expansive streets or streets without trees = faster less attentive drivers
- Green space and/or vegetative buffering = psychological relaxation/ stress alleviation, increased physical activity, reduced: air pollution, risk of flooding, noise
- Access to work, goods, and services = income, quality food, health services, schools, social services
- Overall economic health = money to provide services such as policing or libraries
Affordable Housing

Shelter = basic need

Affordable housing can be provided by:

• Market (not deed restricted)
• Dedicated providers (provided for qualified households)

30% or less of income toward housing or household is considered “cost burdened”

Low income definitions:
1. Low income HH at 50-80% [HUD area] median family income (HAMFI)
2. Very low income HH at 30-50% HAMFI
3. Extremely low-income HH <30% HAMFI
Local Affordable Housing

Census 2013-2017= Ada County Median Income $60,151

*Approximately 35% of (Boise) HH are in some category of qualified low-income earning.

A full time Idaho minimum wage earner 30% of income = $377/ month in rent

*City of Boise 2015 Housing Needs Analysis: Unsheltered homelessness is increasing. There are 801 transitional/ emergency beds and 488 Permanent/ Rapid Re-housing beds vs. 2,461/2,373 in Salt Lake City
Garden City Housing Stock

Housing Stock:

- 59% Single Family Homes
- 21% Multi-Family
- 20% Mobile Homes

Garden City 3% of Ada County Population
And 9% of the Housing Vouchers (Section 8) in Ada County

* City of Boise 2015 Housing Needs Analysis
Census Tract 11: Median HH income $24,575/Year
*Data USA 2016 Estimate

These households can afford around $600/month in rent

$720* Craigslist MFH
$835* Craigslist 1BAPT
$750 = $15,575 for food, utilities, MFH, medical, transportation, daycare, etc.

On 9/26/2019 Craigslist lowest price in Garden City: $925
## BARRIERS TO AFFORDABLE HOUSING

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Builder</th>
<th>Homeowner</th>
<th>Community</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NIMBY</td>
<td>Rising prices/ Existing prices high</td>
<td>Quality Jobs/ Under employment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Land Cost/ Gentrification</td>
<td>Home ownership costs: commuting, taxes, insurance, utilities, repairs, etc.</td>
<td>Idaho’s empty Housing Trust Fund (Legislation passed in 1992 to help provide affordable housing but never funded</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competitive Subsidies</td>
<td>Initial Price for close-in</td>
<td>International/ National investments in housing stocks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infill Cost &amp; Complexity</td>
<td>Economic &amp; Interest Rate uncertainty</td>
<td>Private Property Rights: change to market rate/ redevelop property to other use</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impact fee</td>
<td>Investor Competition</td>
<td>Lack of enabling legislation (FL doc stamp): cannot demand affordable housing be built</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No housing land bank</td>
<td>Income constraints- food, daycare, etc.</td>
<td>Revenue vs. Service costs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appraisals/ comparable/ financing</td>
<td>Inventory of “Affordable Housing” Low (&lt;200K)</td>
<td>Constituents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Realtor resistance to ‘price per square foot’</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The puzzle???

• Reduce the cost of housing?
• Reduce the cost of other financial burdens?
• Increase income?
• Change financing?
• Change status quo?
• Change perceptions?
What the City has done

- **Substandard housing**
  - Shift culpability to include property owners vs. renters
  - Code, policy, and procedure changes
  - Applied for State CO2 alarms

- **Hands on with developments that are trying to achieve affordability**

- **Participation- GCCC, housing roundtable**

- **Public Investment**
  - Parks
  - Greenbelt, sidewalks, and bridges
  - Supportive land use model

- **Code**
  - Reduce restrictions against multi-family
  - Minimum densities (without a CUP)
  - Remove minimum square foot
  - Increase densities allowed within zones
  - Require sidewalks and connectivity
  - Weave transportation provisions into code
  - Limit large tracts of homogenous housing types
  - Allow for housing/ accessory dwellings in all commercial and residential zones
  - Reduced parking requirements; allow for offsite parking within 300’
  - Reduced minimum lot size
The Minor Planned Unit Development

• What
  – Pre-approved template
  – Infill
  – Can be coupled with Minor Land Division

• Strengths
  – Less ‘scary’ density design
  – Fast Tracks Development
  – Marketing tool- think beyond a flag lot
  – Path forward for difficult lots
  – Reduce planning costs and uncertainties
  – Promotes a mix of housing types
  – Can allow for housing cooperative, rentals, or condominiums

• Limitations
  – Every property is unique
  – It’s different...
MPUD in Action

• Parkway Station
  – Currently at a net gain

• Neighborworks
  – Multiple ‘Pocket Neighborhoods’
Thank you!

Jenah Thornborrow
jthorn@gardencityidaho.org